

Kä, H.U. (1993). On Shulman's "The Quantitative Investigation of Psychoanalytic Theory and Therapy: A Bibliography 1986-1992". Psy...

PSYCHOANALYTIC PSYCHOLOGY

(1993). *Psychoanalytic Psychology*, 10(4):593-595

On Shulman's "The Quantitative Investigation of Psychoanalytic Theory and Therapy: A Bibliography 1986-1992"

Horst U. Kä, M.D. 

I would like to point out that the 1992 article by Shulman should have modestly been titled "A North American Selection of the Quantitative Investigation of Psychoanalytic Theory and Therapy." It is to be praised that Shulman tries to raise the research-oriented, quantitative consciousness within the psychoanalytic field. However, some issues have to be solved that might otherwise hamper development.

First, what criteria for *psychoanalytic* does Shulman use? For example, he includes Klerman's Interpersonal Psychotherapy, which in my view is a far cry from psychoanalysis even when using the very liberal definition of it that we have proclaimed for many years (Thomä & Kächele, 1987, 1992). He also includes quite a few references from the general field of psychotherapy research that are not very psychoanalytic.

Non-North American literature seems to escape the author's collecting efforts; for example, important work by Rainer Krause on emotion and facial action (e.g., Krause & Lütolf, 1988) is totally neglected although it recently has been noticed even by Otto Kernberg in his latest book (Kernberg, 1992). This is even more astonishing as the author seems to have been aware of the collection entitled *Psychoanalytic Process Research Strategies* (Dahl, Kächele, & Thomä, 1988); he includes the chapter by Silberschatz,

Requests for reprints should be sent to Horst U. Kächele, MD, Department of Psychotherapy, University of Ulm, Am Hochsträss 8, D-89081 Ulm, Germany.

- 593 -

Curtis, Fretter, and Kelly in the bibliography but leaves out all the other contributions in that reader (e.g., Strupp, Gill and Hoffman, Luborsky, and Dahl; the Germans, among them Krause and Lütolf, are left out altogether).

To be fair, the bibliography contains four names (Kordy, Lieberz, Peichl, Reidel) from the journal *Zeitschrift für psychosomatische Medizin und Psychoanalyse*, which contains the majority of quantitative contributions on psychoanalytic research. Any issue of this journal in the past 6 years contains references that would fit in the bibliography presented, as the members of the 25 psychoanalytically oriented university departments of psychosomatic medicine and psychotherapy in Germany publish in this journal as well as others. It is unclear to me how the author picked just those four names from the many authors and articles he could have included in his collection. As there are even more journals that publish empirical psychoanalytic work (*Psychotherapy*, *Psychosomatik und medizinische Psychologie* to give one additional example), I wonder what happens to other languages in this bibliography, such as the Russian psychoanalytic literature that has had a recent reawakening.

My own work modestly has been mentioned: one paper from the *International Journal of Psycho-Analysis* and another paper delivered at a 1988 meeting of the American Psychoanalytic Association, which has since been published in *Psychotherapy Research*. Two papers out of approximately 40 papers I have written in the 6 years are covered by the bibliography; quantitatively, this is not an impressive degree of representativeness. Your journal might ask for an overview of German quantitative investigations of psychoanalytic theory and therapy—a bibliography from 1986 to 1992. A list of my own English publications during that period follows.

References

Dahl, H., Kächele, H., & Thomä, H. (Eds.). (1988). *Psychoanalytic process research strategies*. Berlin: Springer-Verlag.





Kernberg, O. (1992). *Aggression in personality disorders and perversions*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.


Krause, R., & Lütolf, P. (1988). Facial indicators of transference processes within psychoanalytic treatment. In H. Dahl, H.

Kächele, & H. Thomä (Eds.), *Psychoanalytic process research strategies* (pp. 257-272). Berlin: Springer-Verlag.

Shulman, D. G. (1992). The Quantitative Investigation of Psychoanalytic Theory and Therapy *Psychoanal. Psychol.*


9:529-542 

Thomä, H., & Kächele, H. (1987). *Psychoanalytic practice*: Vol. 1. Principles. Berlin: Springer-Verlag. 

Thomä, H., & Kächele, H. (1992). *Psychoanalytic practice*: Vol. 2. Clinical studies. Berlin: Springer-Verlag. 

- 594 -

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aeschelmann, D., Schwilk, C., Kächele, H., & Pokorny, D. (1992). Defense mechanisms in patients with bone marrow transplantation: A retrospective study. *Israel Journal of Psychiatry and Related Sciences*, 29, 89-99.
- Heckmann, H., Hölzer, M., Kächele, H., & Robben, H. (1987). Resistance and transference as two main constituents in an "experimental analogue" of free association. In W. Huber (Ed.), *Progress in psychotherapy research* (pp. 582-593). Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium: Presses Universitaire de Louvain.
- Kächele, H. (1986). Validating psychoanalysis: What methods for which task? *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 9, 244.
- Kächele, H. (1988). Clinical and Scientific Aspects of the Ulm Process Model of Psychoanalysis. *Int. J. Psycho-Anal.* 69:65-73 [\[→\]](#)
- Kächele, H. (1992). Narration and observation in psychotherapy research. Reporting on a 20 year long journey from qualitative case reports to quantitative studies on the psychoanalytic process. *Psychotherapy Research*, 2, 1-15.
- Kächele, H., Thomä, H., Ruberg, W., & Grünzig, H.-J. (1988). Audio-recordings of the psychoanalytic dialogue: Scientific, clinical and ethical problems. In H. Dahl, H. Kächele, & H. Thomä (Eds.), *Psychoanalytic process research strategies* (pp. 179-194). Berlin: Springer-Verlag.
- Leuzinger-Bohleber, M., & Kächele, H. (1988). From Calvin to Freud: Using an artificial intelligence model to investigate cognitive changes during psychoanalysis. In H. Dahl, H. Kächele, & H. Thomä (Eds.), *Psychoanalytic process research strategies* (pp. 291-306). Berlin: Springer-Verlag.
- Mergenthaler, E., & Kächele, H. (1988). The Ulm Textbank Management System: A tool for psychotherapy research. In H. Dahl, H. Kächele, & H. Thomä (Eds.), *Psychoanalytic process research strategies* (pp. 195-212). Berlin: Springer-Verlag.
- Mergenthaler, E., & Kächele, H. (1991). The Ulm Textbank Research Project. In L. E. Beutler & M. Crago (Eds.), *Psychotherapy research: An international review of programmatic studies* (pp. 219-225). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association. [\[Related→\]](#) 

- 595 -

Article Citation

Kä, H.U. (1993). On Shulman's "The Quantitative Investigation of Psychoanalytic Theory and Therapy. *Psychoanal. Psychol.*, 10(4):593-595